Spanish
Program Review - Comprehensive Review

2023-2024

## Program Context

## 1. Mission <br> Share how your program contributes to the College or fits into the College's Mission. For example, what other academic programs and student/academic services does your program engage with? Examples of student/academic services include the Learning Center, Library, STEM Center, SparkPoint, Dream Center, etc. <br> Another example, how does your program fit into any of the College's plans (such as Equity, Technology, Strategic Enrollment, etc.)? If your program has a mission statement, you may include it here.

Cañada College Mission: Cañada College engages and empowers students in transforming their lives and communities through quality education.

Spanish program description: The Spanish department offers Spanish classes at a variety of levels, from beginner to literature. There are classes for students of Spanish as a foreign language, as well as classes specifically designed for native Spanish speakers. In addition to improving students' linguistic abilities, all courses include discussion of aspects of the culture of Spanish speakers.

The Spanish program strives to serve all of Cañada's students, whether they are studying Spanish as a foreign language or they are heritage speakers of Spanish. Since Spanish is the only world language available at Cañada, in order to provide access to the offerings in the department, it is important that there be courses available for every Cañada student.

All Spanish courses have a twofold purpose: increasing students' linguistic abilities as well as their knowledge and awareness of cultural aspects of the Spanish speaking peoples. Improved language skills combined with increased cultural awareness contribute to transforming student lives, by helping students achieve their academic, workforce-related, or personal enrichment goals, while promoting a better understanding of their local and global communities.

In summary, the Spanish program contributes to the college's mission by making sure that all of Cañada's students have access to a Spanish course at their level and that all of our courses have student learning outcomes that increase cultural literacy.

## 2. Articulation

Are there changes in curriculum or degree requirements at high schools or 4-year institutions that may impact your program? If so, describe the changes and your efforts to accommodate them. If no changes have occurred, please write "no known changes."
High School:
I am not aware of any new articulation needs based on changes in curriculum and degree requirements at the high school level.
4-year institutions:
CaIGETC:
When the new CaIGETC pattern is implemented, course enrollments in Spanish are expected to be negatively impacted, since the two areas where Spanish courses fit in CSU GE and IGETC have been reduced or eliminated.

In Area C, CSU GE requires 3 courses, one in the Arts and one in Humanities, plus one more in either the Arts or the Humanities, but CaIGETC requires only one course in the Arts and one course in the
Humanities. Additionally, in CaIGETC SPAN 110 and SPAN 120 cannot be applied towards the Humanities requirement.

For Area 6 of IGETC, Language other than English (LOTE), students can apply any of the following Spanish courses: SPAN 110, 120, 122, 131, 132, 140, 145, 162, 220, 230. However, there is no LOTE requirement in CaIGETC, so students will have fewer reasons to take SPAN courses.

## Spanish - Comprehensive Review

In an effort to better prepare future articulation needs related to the state-wide common course numbering requirement that will be in effect in Fall 2025, the curriculum review of Spanish courses completed in 20222023 included some changes that resulted in alignment of Spanish courses within our District: course numbers and prerequisites were changed such that they are identical among the three colleges. This was possible after extensive discussion with Spanish faculty at CSM and Skyline, as well as consultation with articulation officers at the three colleges.

Spanish courses already have C-ID, which is expected to facilitate the mapping onto state-wide common course numbers.
> 3. Community \& Labor Needs

> Are there changes in community needs, employment needs, technology, licensing, or accreditation that may affect your program? If so, describe these changes and your efforts to accommodate them. If no changes have occurred, please write "no known changes". CTE programs: identify the dates of your most recent advisory group meeting and describe your advisory group's recommendations for your program.

We did not have information comparable with the labor market report that is available for this program review, so I cannot note the changes in community and labor needs that might have happened since the last program review.

In what follows, I highlight the main observations from the current labor market report.

- A degree in Spanish may be necessary for some jobs, but Spanish skills are required for a greater number of jobs in a wide variety of fields. Therefore, the focus here is on jobs that require Spanish skills.
- Based on the job postings report, the occupations that require Spanish skills do not necessarily require advanced degrees. The vast majority of them either don't list a level of education, or require high school education or a bachelor's degree, but much less often a Masters or Ph.D.
- Over the last year, among job postings in San Francisco, San Mateo and Santa Clara counties, there were over 1000 job postings each month that required Spanish language.
- By far, the majority of the jobs requiring Spanish skills are in the larger cities, San Francisco and San Jose.
- The occupations seeking employees with Spanish skills are in a variety of fields, such as education (teachers, academic and career counselors), sales (both retail and industry), customer service, law (lawyers, paralegals, legal assistants, customs and immigration officers), management, medical (nurses, health services, mental health counselors, medical assistants, dental assistants, patient representatives), social and human services, administrative assistants.
- The top "industry" looking to hire employees with Spanish skills is education (all levels, from preschool to university), followed by child and youth services and medical. In education, there are job postings that require a range of Spanish skills, including bilingual individuals.
- The top employers looking for employees with Spanish skills are the San Francisco Unified School District, the U.S. Department of Homeland Security and the University of California.


## Looking Back

## 4. Curricular changes

List any significant changes that have occurred over the prior years in your program's curricular offerings, scheduling, or mode of delivery. For decisions made by your department, explain the rationale for these changes. If applicable, how have state policy changes affected your curricular offerings?
Certificate of Bilingualism and Biliteracy in English/Spanish:

The certificate had been banked due to the banking of one of the required courses, SPAN 161. SPAN 161 was banked in part due to a misunderstanding about the consequences of not updating it, and it was not updated because it was constantly scheduled but canceled due to low enrollment. There used to be two Latino Literature courses: SPAN 161 and SPAN 162. After repeated cancellations, it became evident that our enrollment could not justify offering both of them, so SPAN 161 was deleted. Therefore, SPAN 161 was removed from Spanish Associate Degrees, and the Certificate of Bilingualism and Biliteracy in English/Spanish was modified to require only one literature course (SPAN 162), and it was unbanked and offered once again.

## Mode of delivery:

Because of the Covid-19 pandemic and the impossibility to offer courses in person, the Spanish courses which didn't yet have a Distance Education (DE) addendum were updated with a new DE
addendum. During the pandemic, we started offering Spanish courses via Zoom (online synchronous) instead of in person. In Spring 2022, when in person instruction was once again possible, we reverted the entire Spanish schedule to the pre-pandemic model: all courses had to have an on campus component, whether fully face-to-face or hybrid. However, enrollments were dismal - not a single Spanish course reached 20 students. As a result, we have continued to offer some courses in synchronous modality and others as multi-modal, in addition to hybrid courses that meet partially on campus. The pandemic forced us to experiment with new delivery modalities, and enrollment data has shown us that we need to continue to offer courses in multiple modalities. This is an ongoing challenge for the Spanish department, because, except for the first Spanish course in the sequence, SPAN 110 Elementary Spanish, our enrollment can only support one section of every other course.

Scheduling:
Over time, Spanish courses scheduled during the daytime had lower enrollment than our evening courses. If only one section of a course could be offered, it has been scheduled in the evening. In the last program review, we reported that we had to reduce our offerings of SPAN 110 from 2 daytime sections to only 1 , which had caused a decline in enrollment in our daytime section of SPAN 120 ; since then, the daytime section was not offered any more. Currently, other than one section of SPAN 110 Elementary Spanish, the entirety of the Spanish program is offered in the evening.

District-wide alignment of Spanish courses:
During AY 2022-2023, Spanish offerings in the three colleges in our district were aligned in terms of the number of units, course number, and transferability. This was done in anticipation for the common course numbering requirement from the state, which needs to be accomplished by Fall 2025.

## 5A. Progress Report - IPC Feedback

## Provide your responses to all recommendations received in your last program review cycle.

There was no feedback from IPC to the mid-cycle 2019-2020 program review.
Responses to IPC feedback to 2017-2018 IPR
(https://canadacollege.edu/programreview/1718/1718_IPR_Spanish_IPCFeedback.pdf)
3. Community and Labor Needs:

Question from IPC: Is there information available regarding research (what types of aspects of learning Spanish are needed in the different industries)?

Answer: I am not aware of the availability of such research.
Question: Information needed: labor needs and technology needs

Answer: there was no information regarding labor needs available for past program reviews. For the current program review, the need for Spanish skills in the labor market is addressed in question 3. There are currently no technology needs.

## 5.A. Progress Report - IPC Feedback:

Comment from IPC: The feedback provided originally was intended to help the deparment consider new aspects and opportunities. Expand or demonstrate the idea that the argument that best practices are already in use.

Answer: the methodology used in our Spanish courses follows guidelines and standards recognized in our field; in particular we follow the recommendations of the American Council for the Teaching of Foreign Languages. Spanish faculty have training and experience in current language teaching methods.

## 8.B. Completion - Success Online

Comment from IPC: One online technology utilized at other campuses is synchronous online classes, utilizing zoom, google hangouts, adobe connect.

Answer: Cañada started offering synchronous online classes during the Covid-19 pandemic, and continues offering sections in this modality to date. Completion-Success Online is discussed in 8.C below.

## 11. Program Planning:

Recommendation from IPC: Further description of program plans for improvement
Comment from IPC: Further descritpion on future plans for improvement specifically
Answer: Question is not clear. Program plans for improvement are addressed in 7.C. below for the current program review.

Overall Recommendations from IPC:
Collect more detailed infomation from industry regarding what aspects of spanish can be explored. Connect the disconnect between the strong need for biligual employees and the low erollment. What improvments can be made working with the online and hybrid options for students?

1. In response to an expressed need for Spanish for Medical Professionals, courses were created. They were offered only once. Enrollment was low, so these courses were never scheduled again, and they were deleted.
2. Demographic information for our service area suggests that there is a very significant percentage of the population who is already bilingual.
3. All of our courses can be offered in hybrid format. Since Spanish courses are not necessarily 3 units, offering them in hybrid format has allowed us to fit them within the existing blocks in the schedule. Additionally, by offering hybrid courses with at most 3 units of synchronous time (whether in person or via Zoom), we've been able to schedule 5 -unit courses that meet only one evening per week.
4. There are currently no fully online courses. This is due to the need to develop conversational skills, which can only be developed by having actual conversations, and conversations require that people interact in real time. It is possible to explore whether a fully online delivery is appropriate for Spanish for Heritage Speakers courses; students who enroll in these courses are already conversational in Spanish, although not necessarily at a variety of registers.

Provide a summary of the progress you have made on the program goals identified in your last program review.

Goal 1: Explore opportunities for students to study abroad in Spanish speaking countries.
Progress report:
In our District's regular semester-long study abroad program, Spanish can be offered only when the study abroad program happens in a Spanish-speaking country; with the current rotation, this is only once every four semesters/two years. In order to increase opportunities to study abroad in Spanish speaking countries, I proposed a faculty-led short-term program in Barcelona for Summer 2020. It was canceled and rescheduled twice due to the Covid-19 pandemic, and finally offered in Summer 2022. With only one month to recruit students (the time between District approval of this first study abroad program after the pandemic started and the application deadline), I was able to exceed the target number of participants. More students contacted me after the application deadline passed; for other study abroad programs, we were able to add late applicants, but this was not possible in Summer 2022 due to the difficulty in securing housing for students in Barcelona. I also received many inquiries about whether this program would be run in Summer 2023. All of this shows that there is great interest and potential for continuing to offer short-term programs. These programs are not common in the community colleges, and they can be appealing to graduating high school students, so they could serve to attract students to our district.
Goal 2: Continue to offer a full Spanish program, despite low enrollment in some courses.
Progress report:
Our enrollments could not support two Latino Literature courses (SPAN 161 and SPAN 162), so SPAN 161 was deleted, and the Spanish degrees and the Certificate of Bilingualism and Biliteracy in English/Spanish was modified accordingly.
We have been offering SPAN 150 and SPAN 152 - Spanish for Heritage Speakers as concurrently scheduled. We used to offer both of them each semester, one in the daytime and one in the evening, but the daytime course had lower enrollment and we stopped offering it. Additionally, the demand for SPAN 152 was lower than for SPAN 150, and SPAN 152 was often cancelled. However, by scheduling the courses concurrently, students still have both courses available each semester.
We continue to offer the intermediate series (SPAN 131, 132, 140, 3 units each) as concurrently scheduled courses, so that they can all be offered and we can combine enrollments. Starting with AY 2024-2025, intermediate courses will be SPAN 130 and SPAN 140 (4 units each).
The only Spanish course which is consistently scheduled for two sections, one in the daytime and one in the evening, is SPAN 110. We used to do the same for SPAN 120, but since the last program review we have only scheduled one section of SPAN 120 in the evening
In summary, we continue to offer a full Spanish program, but low enrollment has forced us to eliminate some sections and offer some courses concurrently. In a discipline like Spanish, it is impossible to recruit students for a certain course; we can promote Spanish courses in general, but which course students enroll in depends on their level of Spanish.
Unfortunately, the academic need for students to take Spanish courses will decrease in the future with the implementation of CaIGETC. Still, students take Spanish courses for a variety of reasons, not just because it may be a transfer requirement, so we hope that community interest, personal development and career needs will continue to bring students to our courses.
Spanish is the only "foreign" language offered at Cañada College. For about a third of our student population who are Spanish-speaking there is no "foreign" language option; still, the Spanish for Heritage Speakers courses are extremely valuable for the continued development of their native language literacy. For these reasons, we need to continue to offer a full Spanish program.

## 6A. Impact of Resource Applications

Describe the impact to date of previously requested new resources (assignment, equipment, facilities, research, funding) including both resource requests that were approved and not approved. What impact have

## Spanish - Comprehensive Review

these resources had on your program and measures of student success? What have you been unable to accomplish due to resource requests that were not approved?

No previously requested new resources. Not applicable.

## 6B. Impact of Staffing Changes

Describe the impact on your program of any changes within the last program review cycle in staffing levels (for example, the addition, loss or reassignment of faculty/staff). If no changes have occurred please write "not applicable."
The program continues to operate with only one full-time faculty, and one to three adjunct faculty depending on the semester. However, the full-time faculty's workload is rarely $100 \%$ devoted to teaching Spanish. When the full-time faculty was on leave (due to using banked units or engaged in semester-long professional development) or teaching abroad, the course offerings were reduced.
When the full-time faculty was on leave, participated in the District's study abroad program or has had a large portion of her workload reassigned for other duties, she continued to perform necessary duties for the program to run smoothly. So, in addition to the impact on the number of courses scheduled, there was a significant impact on the full-time faculty who was dedicated to other duties and working remotely.

## Current State of the Program

## 7A. Enrollment Trends

Use the data provided by PRIE to examine your enrollments by department or courses. Describe trends in headcount, FTES, and load. If applicable, describe any other enrollment data that is relevant to your program.

Headcount:


Headcount in Spanish was up 43.5\% in 2022-2023 (241 students) compared to 2018-2019 (168 students). Headcount increased steadily for two academic years then decreased for the next two academic years.

## Enrollments:



Enrollment in Spanish was up 70.5\% in 2022-2023 compared to five years ago in 2018-2019. Spanish enrollment reached a five-year high in 2020-2021 with 379 enrollments and a five-year low of 190 enrollments in 2018-2019.

## FTES:

Spanish - Comprehensive Review


Full-time equivalent students (FTES) in Spanish was up 38\% in the most recent academic year (2022-2023) compared to five years ago (2018-2019), an increase of 8.4 FTES.

## Section Count:

Spanish - Comprehensive Review


The number of sections offered in Spanish increased from 9 sections in 2018-2019 to 15 sections the following academic year. Then the section count remained at 14 for the next three academic years (20202021 through 2022-2023).

## FTEF:

Spanish - Comprehensive Review


The number of full-time equivalent faculty (FTEF) in Spanish went from 2 in 2018-2019 to 4 FTEF for the next three academic years, then increased to 5 FTEF in 2022-2023.

LOAD:


Load in Spanish fluctuated over the last five academic years with a sharp decline in 2021-2022. The highest load in Spanish occurred in 2020-2021 with 303 and the lowest load was the following academic year in 2021-2022 at 169.

## 7B. Significant Changes in Your Program

Have there been any significant changes in enrollment trends or course offerings? For example, has there been a significant increase or drop in FTES or Load? If applicable, consider trends in class cancellation rates and how it might have affected your course offerings. If needed, consider how the pattern of course offerings (times/days/duration/delivery mode/number of sections) affected your enrollment?

## Enrollment/FTES:

Spanish was the only department in the Humanities and Social Sciences Division that experienced an increase in enrollment during the Covid-19 pandemic. Although we don't have statistical data, anecdotal information from our students may help explain this:
a. Community members found themselves unable to pursue other interests and occupations due to the restrictions of lock-down. During the pandemic they time in their hands and in their desire to do something productive and mentally stimulating, they decided to learn Spanish.
b. High school students were not able to participate in some of their usual extra-curricular activities. We had a surge in concurrent enrollment when high school students sought to earn college credit. They found our courses taught via Zoom convenient, especially since our evening courses did not conflict with their high school classes.

Spanish - Comprehensive Review
During the Covid-19 pandemic, some of our courses experienced record enrollments, reaching the maximum number of students and with waitlists. In Summer 2020 and Summer 2021, we ran two sections of SPAN 110, which was unprecedented.

In Spring 2022, our Spanish program reverted back to the pre-pandemic schedule: every course had to have some in-person hours (either face-to-face or hybrid). Enrollments this semester were dismal, with no course reaching 20 students.

Since then, we have been scheduling some courses as synchronous and others as multi-modal, in addition to on-campus.

## Section Count:

Although the section count graph in 7.A shows that the number of sections offered in Spanish had a sharp increase from 9 sections in 2018-2019 to 15 sections the following academic year, this is only due to the choice of base year. In 2018-2019, the full-time Spanish faculty was on professional development leave (fall 2018) and banked unit leave (spring 2019), and fewer sections than normal were scheduled. The section count has remained stable at 14-15 for four academic years (2019-2020 through 2022-2023).

## FTEF:

The number of full-time equivalent faculty (FTEF) in Spanish was only 2 in 2018-2019 because the full-time faculty was on leave, and a much reduced schedule was offered. FTEF was 4 for the next three academic years. It has been reported that the FTEF increased to 5 in 2022-2023, but this must be in error. In 2022-2023 there were actually fewer sections offered than in 2021-2022.

LOAD:
There was a sharp decline in LOAD from 2020-2021 to 2021-2022. We can think of three reasons for this decline in LOAD, which was actually more pronounced in Spring 2022 (198) than in Fall 2021 (297): when the restrictions of lock down were lifted, community members returned to the types of activities they were doing pre-pandemic, and high school students returned to high school in person, and in Spring 2022, all Spanish courses went from synchronous (online) to requiring on-campus in-person meetings, and LOAD was significantly lower than in the previous semester. Since then, we've scheduled some sections as synchronous and others as multi-modal, and LOAD recovered somewhat in 2022-2023, although not to the level we had during the Covid-19 pandemic.

## 7C. Planning for Your Program

What changes could be implemented, including changes to course scheduling (times/days/duration/delivery mode/number of sections), curriculum, marketing, and articulation of pathways that might improve these trends? If applicable, include plans for faculty recruitment and faculty training. NOTE: If other sources of data are used, please upload these documents or provide URLs.

Scheduling/delivery mode:
The Spanish program went through scheduling changes in the past, in order to meet students' needs and preferences. Although typically 5 -unit language courses are scheduled 5 days a week because this is the best type of schedule for language learning, our courses were first scheduled 3 days a week, then twice a week. When online courses became more popular, there was pressure to convert Spanish courses too, and we agreed to make them hybrid, so as to keep some in-person hours. By offering courses in hybrid modality, we have been able to schedule courses with just one meeting per week. These changes go against what's best from a pedagogical perspective, but we've had to adjust to our students' needs and preferences.

Because of the Covid-19 pandemic, we had to convert all of our Spanish courses to synchronous delivery. This required a great amount of work on the part of faculty, as well as an adjustment for both students and instructors. And although in-person meetings allow for a richer language learning experience, we were successful in synchronous modality as well. Many students are finding this new modality very

Spanish - Comprehensive Review
convenient for a variety of reasons. Going forward, we will continue to be mindful of students' needs and preferences when scheduling courses, even if this goes against best practises for language learning; the consequence of ignoring what students want could result in lower enrollment. Offering sections in different modalities would be ideal, but this is impossible for the Spanish department, where there is a single section of each course except for the first one in our sequence, SPAN 110.

Impact of CaIGETC on enrollment:
With the implementation of CaIGETC, course enrollments in Spanish are expected to be negatively impacted, because transfer students will have fewer reasons to take Spanish courses: there will be fewer courses needed in the Arts and Humanities, fewer Spanish courses will count towards the Humanities requirement and there will not be a Language other than English (LOTE) requirement.

We know that students take Spanish courses for a variety of reasons, and transfer is just one of them. About one third of Cañada students are native speakers of Spanish, and for them, Spanish for Heritage Speakers is a course that helps with their literacy development in Spanish. In our service area, close to half of the population is Hispanic/Latinx. However, courses to serve these students are not offered at every high school. One potential area to explore for growing our program/enrollment is as dual enrollment for high schools that do not offer Spanish for Heritage Speakers.

We also know that many community members who are not pursuing an educational goal enroll in Spanish courses. From the labor market report, we know that there are many job postings that list Spanish as a required skill. So another strategy for potentially increasing enrollments would be to focus on community members wanting to learn Spanish for personal development or to have a skill that's desirable for employment.

The Spanish program will need the assistance and support of marketing and outreach in order to implement strategies to help increase enrollment, to counter a decrease in enrollment triggered by CaIGETC.

## 8A. Access \& Completion

Describe the student completion and success rate in your courses and/or program using the data provided by PRIE. Look at your course offerings, in the last program review cycle was it possible for a student to complete your certificates or degrees while only completing courses at Cañada College? How can the college help you improve student completion and success? What changes could be made?
Success and Withdrawal Rates by Year:
Success and Withdraw Rate
Academic Year

0.6
0.5
$\stackrel{\circ}{\geqslant} 0.4$
0.3
0.2

0.1
0.0
2018-2019 2019-2020 2020-2021 2021-2022 2022-2023
Success Rate
Success Rate
Withdraw rate

The overall success rate in Spanish was between 71\% and 76\% over the last five academic years. Overall withdraw rates peaked at 23\% in 2020-2021 and reached a five-year low in the most recent academic year at 14\% (2022-2023).

## Course Success and Withdrawal by Course:



Course success rates in Spanish ranged from a minimum of $48 \%$ in SPAN 111 to a maximum of $100 \%$ in SPAN 145. Withdraw rates in Spanish ranged from a maximum of $40 \%$ in SPAN 111 to no withdrawals in SPAN 145.

SPAN 111 is not a stand-alone course. It is scheduled concurrently with a section of SPAN 110. SPAN 111 typically enrolls very few students: between 2 and 7 per semester for the last 10 semesters, with a total of 40 students in 10 semesters. The situation with SPAN 112 is similar. There were between 1 and 8 students per semester for the last 10 semesters, with a total of 31 students in 10 semesters. Because of the very low number of students, SPAN 111 and SPAN 112 are excluded from the analysis that follows.

Excluding SPAN 111 and SPAN 112, course success ranged from 60\% in SPAN 110 to 100\% in SPAN 145. SPAN 110 is the first course in the Spanish sequence. It is a 5 -unit course. Students who enroll in SPAN 110 either had no previous experience learning another language, or know some Spanish, but not enough to enroll in the next course, so their previous language learning experience was not successful. Unfortunately, these students often have unrealistic expectations regarding the time and effort that learning a new language requires, and this is compounded with the fact that most other college classes are only 3 units, and students wrongly assume that all courses have a similar workload, regardless of the number of units. We do communicate the expectations both orally and in writing, but for some students, this takes time to sink in. By the time they realize what they need to do to be successful in SPAN 110, it's very difficult to make up for lost time and catch up. This is the reason why we have a higher withdrawal rate and a lower success rate in SPAN 110.

Other than SPAN 110, the lowest success rate in Spanish for the years since the last program review was 74\% in SPAN 120 and SPAN 150. Our lowest success rate is higher than the college average for the last five years, which ranged from $71.1 \%$ to $73 \%$.

## Spanish - Comprehensive Review <br> Program/Certificate Completion:

Based on the courses that were offered since the last program review, a student would have been able to complete an Associate Degree in Spanish taking courses only at Cañada. The student would have had to take courses in the evening, with the exception of perhaps one course.

In AY 2018-2019 and AY 2019-2020, SPAN 162 was not offered. Therefore, a student may not have been able to obtain the Certificate in Bilingualism and Biliteracy in English/Spanish taking courses only at Cañada. Skyline College offers SPAN 160 -Readings in Literature in Spanish. This Skyline course has been approved as substitute for our SPAN 162 for students wishing to obtain the Certificate in Bilingualism and Biliteracy in English/Spanish.

## 8B. Student Equity

One of the goals of the College's Student Equity plan is to close the performance gaps for disproportionately impacted students. Use the data provided by PRIE that indicates which groups are experiencing a disproportionate impact in your program. Which gaps are most important for improving outcomes in your program? How can the college help you address these gaps? What changes could be made?

## Access

Access is an indicator of what student subgroups are enrolling in courses, based on unique student counts. Enrollment data revealed one student subgroup was underrepresented in Spanish compared to the collegewide population (see Table 1). The proportion of students age 18 - 22 enrolled in Spanish during 2022-2023 academic year was 16.4 percentage points lower than the proportion of students in the same age group enrolled college-wide.

Table 1.
Student Subgroup Gap

Age 18-22
-16.4

## [1] Source: https://canadacollege.edu/prie/dashboards/disproportionate-impact.php

Spanish has an older student population than the college average. This is not necessarily bad. It means that there are older students interested in taking Spanish courses.
In courses of Spanish as a foreign language, we normally have many community members that do not have a transfer, degree or certificate goal, who wish to learn Spanish. Students aged 18-22 seeking an Associate Degree do not need to take Spanish, and those who are interested in transferring need a Language other than English (LOTE) in order to transfer to the UC system, but may have already fulfilled this requirement in high school, especially because many districts have a LOTE graduation requirement.
In Spanish for Heritage Speakers courses, we typically have immigrant Latinx students who attend college as working adults with family responsibilities.

## Success

Success is the rate at which different student subgroups pass courses and is based on enrollments. The success rate for different subgroups in Spanish was compared to the overall success rate in Spanish. The difference between the two rates (the gap) revealed two subgroups may have been disproportionately impacted (see Table 2). The success rate for Asian male students was 38.6 percentage points lower than the overall success rate in Spanish during the 2022-2023 academic year. The success rate for male students
enrolled in synchronous Spanish sections was 23 percentage points lower than the overall success rate for synchronous Spanish sections.

Table 2.

> Student Subgroup Gap
$\begin{array}{ll}\text { Asian Males } & -38.6\end{array}$

Course Modality: Synchronous - Males
-23.0

Asian Males: -38.6
In SPAN 152 there have been no Asian students in the last 10 semesters, in SPAN 151 there was one, and in SPAN 140 there were two.

The courses that had more enrollment of Asian students were SPAN 110, 120, 131 and 132. The table below calculates how many Asian Males there would have been, on average, in each section of these courses over the last 10 semesters:

| Course | Asian <br> students in 10 <br> semesters | \# of sections <br> in 10 <br> semesters | Avg \# of Asian <br> students per <br> section | \% of Males <br> in each <br> course | Number of <br> Asian Males <br> section |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 110 | 70 | 26 | 2.69 | 38.6 | 1.03 |
| 120 | 21 | 9 | 2.33 | 29.3 | 0.68 |
| 131 | 16 | 11 | 1.45 | 26.2 | 0.38 |
| 132 | 10 | 11 | 0.9 | 33 | 0.29 |

According to the calculation, there would have been, on average 0-1 (none to one) Asian Males in each of these sections. These sections were taught over 5 years by 4 different professors. Individual Spanish faculty have not noticed the pattern of -38.6 success that emerges when all Asian Males are considered as a group, mostly because, as the data shows, each faculty would have had at most one Asian Male, on average, in each class. Faculty reviewed their records for these students, and, for those who were not successful, were able to identify individual or personal reasons why the students were not successful. Some examples include: a busy real estate agent whose schedule kept him from doing work for class regularly, an international student who was still struggling with English and attempted to learn Spanish, and several students who withdrew from classes during Covid. Faculty believe that the fact that Asian Males as a group had a lower success rate was a coincidence, and that perhaps other small groups of students selected randomly might have shown similar results if the success rate of such groups was calculated.

Course modality synchronous Males: -23
Synchronous modality is a recent modality adopted after the Covid-19 pandemic. Seeing that there is a lower success rate among males in this type of modality, we will closely monitor how males do in our synchronous courses going forward.

## Withdraws

Withdraws is the rate at which a student withdraws from a course, with higher numbers being worse, as they indicate greater withdraw rates. The withdraw rates for subgroups in Spanish was compared to the overall withdraw rate for the program. No disproportionate impact was found for withdraws in Spanish.

## 8C. Completion - Success Online

The college has a goal of improving success in online courses. Using the data provided by PRIE, what significant gaps do you see in success between online/hybrid and non-online courses? What changes could be made to reduce these gaps? If your program does not offer online/hybrid courses, please write "not applicable".

| Success Rate <br> by Course | COVID - <br> SYNCHRON <br> OUS | FACE TO <br> FACE | HYBRID | SYNCHRON <br> OUS |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| SPAN-110 | $58 \%$ |  | $63 \%$ | $47 \%$ |
| SPAN-120 | $82 \%$ |  | $72 \%$ | $*$ |
| SPAN-131 | $89 \%$ | $79 \%$ | $76 \%$ | $55 \%$ |
| SPAN-132 | $83 \%$ | $88 \%$ | $86 \%$ | $*$ |
| SPAN-140 | $83 \%$ | $93 \%$ | $100 \%$ | $83 \%$ |
| SPAN-150 | $69 \%$ | $80 \%$ | $58 \%$ | $79 \%$ |
| SPAN-152 | $*$ | $82 \%$ | $100 \%$ | $80 \%$ |

We will need to look at individual sections to understand the data, because by looking at the success rates per course in different modalities, it is difficult to understand some of the differences. For example, for SPAN 150, the success rate is higher in face-to-face ( $80 \%$ ), but in Covid synchronous it was significantly lower (69\%); however, in synchronous modality the success rate (79\%) is comparable to that of face-to-face (80\%). Why would there be such a difference betwen Covid synchronous and synchronous, when in terms of modality they're both synchronous? A similar situation can be observed in SPAN 131: in Covid synchronous, the success rate ( $89 \%$ ) was much higher then in face-to-face ( $79 \%$ ) or hybrid ( $76 \%$ ); why would the success rate have fallen so sharply in synchronous modality (55\%) as compared to Covid synchronous (89\%), if they're both synchronous modalities?

Looking at success rate by modality in general, there is not a clear picture of which modality is most successful in Spanish courses. Success in online modalities is neither higher nor lower than in non-online modalities as a whole. While the success rate seems most consistent (i.e. smaller range) in face to face modality, it's worth noting that there have been success rates of $100 \%$ in hybrid modality in a couple of courses, but no $100 \%$ in face to face.

SPAN 110 has a lower success rate regardless of modality. This has already been addressed in 8.A.
It will be important to determine why the success rates for some courses in a given modality are very low. Some cases may be due to reasons beyond our control that happened in a particular semester. For example, one semester there were over 15 students from a high school that were enrolled as concurrent

## Spanish - Comprehensive Review

enrollment students in SPAN 150. These students lacked preparation for college-level courses, were not supported by their high school, did not have access to technology (access to computers and internet) which was necessary to do course work, and as a result failed the course. This kind of outcome in a large group of students has a significant effect on success measures for the course.

## 9A. SLO Assessment - Compliance

Are all active courses being systematically assessed over a three-year cycle? Refer to the Program's /Department's Three-Year Assessment Plan and describe how the plan is completed across sections and over time.

The following table shows an example of how we assess SLOs over a three-year cycle. Of note, we list courses instead of individual SLOs for each course, because we assess every SLO for each course (in all sections, if there are multiple sections of a course). In the three-year cycle, each course can be seen not just once, but two or three times, because we assess every SLO in each course more frequently than required.

|  | 2020-2021 | 2021-2022 | 2022-2023 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Fall Semester | SPAN 150 <br> SPAN 131/132/140 <br> SPAN 152 | SPAN 150 <br> SPAN 152 <br> SPAN 131/132/140 SPAN 161 | SPAN 150 <br> SPAN 152 <br> SPAN 131/132/140 |
| Spring Semester | SPAN 110/111/112 SPAN 145 | SPAN 120/121/122 SPAN 162 | SPAN 110/111/112 <br> SPAN 145 |
| Notes |  |  |  |
| PLOs <br> Assessed (Identify at least 1 PLO; identify the year \& semester that the PLO will be assessed) | PLO 1 \& 2 <br> SPRING 2021 | PLO 3 \& 4 <br> SPRING2022 | PLO 1 \& 2 <br> SPRING2023 |
| ILOs Assessed (ILOs are listed here as a guidance tool to help you choose courses for assessment) | Critical Thinking Community Communication Quantitative Reasoning Creativity |  | Critical Thinking Community Communication Quantitative Reasoning Creativity |

The following table shows how many SLOs that we assess for each course, as well as the number of times that we have reported results for each SLO.

| Course | SLOs | Assessment Methods | Results |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| CAN SPAN 110 | 4 | 4 | 48 |
| CAN SPAN 111 | 4 | 4 | 42 |
| CAN SPAN 112 | 4 | 4 | 34 |
| CAN SPAN 120 | 6 | 6 | 44 |
| CAN SPAN 121 | 6 | 6 | 6 |
| CAN SPAN 122 | 6 | 6 | 1 |
| CAN SPAN 131 | 6 | 6 | 71 |
| CAN SPAN 132 | 6 | 6 | 71 |
| CAN SPAN 140 | 6 | 3 | 3 |
| CAN SPAN 145 | 3 | 4 | 15 |
| CAN SPAN 150 | 4 | 4 | 16 |
| CAN SPAN 152 | 4 | 4 | 4 |
| CAN SPAN 162 | 4 | 4 | 41 |

## 9B. SLO Assessment - Impact

Summarize the dialogue that has resulted from these course SLO assessments. What specific strategies have you implemented, or plan to implement, based upon the results of your SLO assessment?
By and large, the SLOs have met the criterion for success that we defined. In this case, we feel we're on the right track and it has not been necessary to engage in dialogue.
On the occasions when it was inconclusive whether the criterion for success had been met, it was generally due to having very few students in a course; this was often the case with SPAN 111, 112, 121 and 122 , which are not stand-alone courses and typically enroll a handful of students per semester, if any.

There have been some instances where the cultural SLOs in a course were not met. As a result, we have made it a point to emphasize how important it is to consider cultural aspects of the language that students are learning. This is necessary in order to use the language in a culturally appropriate manner. But, more importantly, students need to set aside their ethnocentrism so as to be able to understand and appreciate other people and other cultures in a non-judgemental manner.

Describe your program's Program Learning Outcomes assessment plan using your Program/Department's <b>Three Year Assessment Plan<b/> Summarize the major findings of your PLO assessments. What are some improvements that have been, or can be, implemented as a result of PLO assessment?
Every year we assess every SLO of the last course in the Spanish sequence for each of the two paths that students can take to obtain an Associate Degree: SPAN 140 for learners of Spanish as a foreign language, and SPAN 152 for heritage speakers of Spanish. Since these courses represent the highest level of Spanish that students attain, the SLOs serve also as our PLOs.
As already mentioned in 9.B, there have been some instances where the cultural SLOs in a course were not met. As a result, we have made it a point to emphasize how important it is to consider cultural aspects of the language that students are learning in order to use the language in a culturally appropriate manner and to set aside their ethnocentrism so as to be able to understand and appreciate others in a non-judgemental manner. In general, there has not been an issue meeting cultural SLOs in SPAN 152. This course enrolls heritage speakers of Spanish (with perhaps at most one exception per semester), and these students take great pride in their culture, and are eager to learn more about the culture of other Spanish-speakers.

## Spanish Program Learning Outcomes:

Students completing this program will be able to:

- Produce and understand oral and written communication at an Advanced High level, as defined by the American Council on the Teaching of Foreign Languages (ACTFL).
- Recognize their own errors and self-correct in order to improve accuracy in Spanish grammar and spelling.
- Compare and contrast cultural aspects of Spanish-speaking countries, including art, music, history, socioeconomic and political realities.
- Compare and contrast cultural elements from Spanish speaking countries with their own culture, both within the Latino culture in the United States and American culture in general.


## Looking Ahead

11. Planning for the future is an important part of Program Review. This is your opportunity to identify new directions for growth and improve your program. Based on your analysis of the data and your responses to the questions above, identify specific and measurable goals and action plans for achieving those goals. Consider goals such as, but not limited to: updating curriculum, closing equity gaps, responding to student and community needs, etc. Please enter your response in the textbox below.
Goal 1: Address Enrollment Challenges
Currently we are able to offer a complete Spanish program, but our schedule is at a bare minimum: we offer two sections of SPAN 110, and only one section of every other course. However, the only way we can afford to offer the intermediate level sequence is by scheduling the three courses concurrently, and differentiating instruction and assessments based on which course each student is enrolled in. Our intermediate level courses are SPAN 131 + SPAN 132 + SPAN 140, restructured as SPAN 130 + SPAN 140 effective Fall 2024. We do something similar with our Spanish for Heritage Speakers courses, SPAN $150+$ SPAN 152, which have been renumbered as SPAN 220 + SPAN 230 effective Fall 2024. And SPAN 162 - Latino Literature is offered only once a year.
With the implementation of CaIGETC, we expect that enrollment in Spanish courses will be negatively impacted, because there will be fewer opportunities to count Spanish courses towards the CaIGETC requirements. Compared to IGETC and CSU GE, in CaIGETC there is no Language other than English (LOTE) requirement, students will need one fewer Humanities course, and SPAN 110 and SPAN 120 will not count towards the Humanities requirement. So fewer transfer students will have an academic incentive to take Spanish.

Action Plan 1.a:
We know that transfer students may not be the majority in our courses, and many community members enroll

## Spanish - Comprehensive Review

in our Spanish courses. In the future, we will need to highlight the benefits of learning Spanish among our students, and we may need to rely even more on students who are not pursuing a degree so that our courses meet minimum enrollment. We will need assistance and support from the Marketing Department and the Outreach Program in order to promote the Spanish program both among our students and in the community, and recruit students for Spanish courses.

Action Plan 1.b:
We can offer SPAN 150 and SPAN 152 (SPAN 220 and SPAN 230) for dual enrollment in high schools that do not offer Spanish for Heritage Speakers courses. However, in order to avoid repeating past experiences where students were not successful, we will need to verify that students are in fact ready to take college level courses, that they have the necessary technology that is required for our courses, and that they will have adequate support from their high school.

Goal 2: Curriculum
All courses in the Spanish program currently have a synchronous component, whether they are taught face-toface, in hybrid modality or via Zoom. We don't offer any online asynchronous courses, because in order to develop interpersonal oral communication in Spanish it is necessary for students to be able to interact in real time. However, students in Spanish for Heritage Speakers courses are already fluent in Spanish, and they have more opportunities to engage in interpersonal oral communication within the community, so there may not be a need to have a synchronous component in these courses.

Action Plan 2:
Develop SPAN 150 and SPAN 152 (SPAN 220 and SPAN 230) as fully online courses.

Goal 3: Low Textbook Cost (LTC) and Zero Textbook Cost (ZTC) courses
There is an increased pressure to offer LTC and ZTC courses. Some Spanish courses are ZTC already. We could continue to convert more courses to ZTC, if good materials available and all potential students have access to the necessary technology for LTC and ZTC courses.

Action Plan 3:
Explore the possibility of converting more courses to ZTC and convert them if appropriate.

Next Step: If your program is requesting resources, please go to "STEP 2: Resource Request (OPTIONAL)" and submit your specific requests there. Otherwise, this is the last prompt in the comprehensive program review form.

## Supporting Information

## General Supporting Documents

Job_Postings_Spanish_Language_SF_SM_SC_10092023.pdf
SPAN_Comprehensive Program Review Data Packet.docx
SPAN_FA18-SP23_Program Review Course Enrollment Report.pdf

